



N T

App No:	23/P/01567		8 Wk 31/01/2024 Deadline:
Appn Ty	pe: Full Application		
Case Of	ficer: Deborah Soulsby		
Parish:	East Horsley	Ward:	Clandon & Horsley
Agent :	Mr. Hall	Applican	Mr. Eagle-Hodgson
	Arc8 Projects	t:	Cherry Tree Cottage Pine Walk
	The Studio		East Horsley
	Walled Garden		Surrey
	Downs Lane		KT24 5AG
	Leatherhead		
	KT22 8JW		

Location: Cherry Tree Cottage, Pine Walk, East Horsley, Leatherhead, KT24 5AG

Proposal: Proposed two storey side extension, single storey rear extension, front porch, together with roof extension to include first floor addition following demolition of rear extension, front porch and bay.

Executive Summary

Reason for referral

This application has been referred to the Planning Committee because more than 10 letters of objection have been received, contrary to the Officer's recommendation.

Key information

Planning permission is sought for the erection of a two storey side extension, single storey rear extension, front porch, together with roof extension to include first floor addition following demolition of rear extension, front porch and bay.

Summary of considerations and constraints

Cherry Tree Cottage is a modest dormer bungalow, designed and built by Frank Chown, an Arts and Craft architect and developer who was active in the 1920's & 30's and who was hugely influential in the development and character of East Horsley. The building is not identified as a statutory or locally listed building but is considered to be of some local historical interest.

As the dwelling is considered to be of some local historical interest, the Council's Conservation and Design Officer was consulted on the application and is supportive of the proposals subject to the imposition of conditions.

The proposed extensions, whilst changing the single storey character of the dwelling, are considered to reflect the original Chown character and detail of the building and therefore, are not considered to result in harm to the character of the dwelling, street scene and surrounding area.

The impact of the proposals on neighbouring properties has been carefully considered and it is not considered that the amenities of neighbouring properties would be significantly harmed.

The proposals are not considered to increase parking within the surrounding area and would not result in harm to highway safety.

Subject to conditions, it is recommended that planning permission be granted.

RECOMMENDATION:

Approve - subject to the following condition(s) and reason(s) :-

1. The development hereby permitted shall be begun before the expiration of three years from the date of this permission.

<u>Reason</u>: To comply with Section 91 of the Town and Country Planning Act 1990 as amended by Section 51(1) of the Planning and Compulsory Purchase Act 2004. 2. The development hereby permitted shall be carried out in accordance with the following approved plans: Location Plan, SH/3709 Rev A Sheet 1 of 2 and SH/3709 Rev A received on 18th September 2023, 14 Rev G, 16 Rev F and 17 Rev H received on 19th December 2023 and 13 Rev G and 18 Rev F received on 15th January 2024.

<u>Reason:</u> To ensure that the development is carried out in accordance with the approved plans and in the interests of proper planning.

3. Prior to the commencement of any development above slab level works, a written schedule with details of the source/ manufacturer, colour and finish, OR samples on request of all external facing and roof materials. This must include the details of embodied carbon/ energy (environmental credentials) of all external materials. These shall be submitted to and approved in writing by the Local Planning Authority and the development shall be carried out using only those detailed.

<u>Reason</u>: To ensure that a satisfactory external appearance of the development is achieved and to ensure materials that are lower in carbon are chosen.

4. No demolition works shall be carried out until details for the protection of the decorative brick plinth and the original bay window have been submitted to and agreed in writing by the Local Planning Authority. The works shall be carried out only in accordance with the agreed protection measures.

<u>Reason</u>: To ensure the retained external original features of the building are protected during construction.

5. Prior to the commencement of development on site a detailed methodology of the taking down and rebuilding of the existing porch shall be submitted to and approved in writing by the Local Planning Authority. The porch shall be rebuilt to the exact design and configuration as the existing porch, reusing the existing

material where viable. To ensure that this can happen the structure's dismantlement shall only be carried out by hand or by tools held in the hand other than power driven tools and securely stored for later reuse.

<u>Reason:</u> In the interests of the external appearance of the proposal.

6. No development shall take place beyond slab level until large scale plans (1:20) have been submitted to and approved in writing by the Local Planning Authority for:

a) Fenestration details including depths of reveal, sections, mouldings, glazing bars, trickle vents, materials, finishes and method of opening;

b) Architectural detail including tile creasing, string coursing, decorative hanging tiles, eyebrow dormer headers;

- c) Headers and cills;
- d) Fascias and soffits;

e) Rainwater goods, vents and flues.

<u>Reason:</u> In the interests of the external appearance of the proposal.

Informatives:

- If you need any advice regarding Building Regulations, please do not hesitate to contact Guildford Borough Council Building Control on 01483 444545 or buildingcontrol@guildford.gov.uk
- 2. This statement is provided in accordance with Article 35(2) of the Town and Country Planning (Development Management Procedure) (England) Order 2015. Guildford Borough Council seek to take a positive and proactive approach to development proposals. We work with applicants in a positive and proactive manner by:

- Offering a pre-application advice service in certain circumstances
- Where pre-application advice has been sought and that advice has been followed we will advise applicants/agents of any further issues arising during the course of the application
- Where possible officers will seek minor amendments to overcome issues identified at an early stage in the application process

However, Guildford Borough Council will generally not engage in unnecessary negotiation for fundamentally unacceptable proposals or where significant changes to an application is required.

Pre-application advice was not sought prior to submission and minor alterations were required to overcome concerns, these were sought and the applicant agreed to the changes.

Officer's Report

Site description.

The application relates to a single storey detached property, with rooms in the roof, located within the identified settlement boundary of East Horsley. The property is located between Lynx Hill and Pine Walk and is accessed from both roads. The surrounding area is primarily residential with a mix of detached dwellings of traditional scale, appearance and materials.

Cherry Tree Cottage is a modest dormer bungalow, designed and built by Frank Chown, an Arts and Craft architect and developer who was active in the 1920's & 30's and who was hugely influential in the development and character of East Horsley. Whilst the building is not identified as a statutory or locally listed building, it is considered to be of some local historical interest by virtue of the following:

- Its link to local architect and developer Frank Chown whose architectural design is significant to the established character and identity of East Horsley.
- Its distinctive architectural detailing which defines it as an original Chown development, including:
- Eyebrow dormers
- Eyebrow eaves line
- Decorative brick plinth
- Feature brick porch

- Mullioned oak framed windows
- Its demonstration of good local building techniques, craftsmanship

Proposal.

The application proposes a two storey side extension, single storey rear extension, front porch, together with roof extension to include first floor addition following demolition of rear extension, front porch and bay.

During the course of the application, revised drawings have been submitted which have amended the appearance of the front elevation and retained the original front porch and amended the rear elevation of the proposal by removing a first floor rear element to the proposal. Reconsultation or neighbours and statutory consultees was undertaken on the revised proposal.

Following the receipt of representations, further amended plans of the proposed side elevations have been received which show the proposed front bay window, the description of the proposal has been amended to include reference to the proposed front porch and the agent has submitted a copy of the Council's Climate Change Questionnaire. It was not considered necessary to reconsult on these additional plans and document and updated description.

Relevant planning history.

Reference:	Description:	Decision Summary:	Appeal:
94/P/0158 8	Erection of two sets of gates, one double and one single.	Approve 16/02/1995	N/A
90/P/0081 7	Erection of a single storey rear extension to kitchen.	Approve 31/07/1990	N/A
95/P//007 27	Erection of single storey extension to provide bedroom and bathroom.		N/A
94/P//008 17	Erection of a single storey rear extension to kitchen.	Approve 26/07/1994	N/A

88/P//013 Side extension to bungalow to Approve N/A
49 provide bedroom, bathroom & 20/09/1988 dining room & rear extension to enlarge kitchen

88/P//004 Side extension to bungalow to Approve N/A
provide bedroom, bathroom & 10/05/1988 dining room and rear extension to enlarge kitchen

Consultations.

East Horsley Parish Council: Object to the proposal on the following grounds:

- Unsympathetic development of a significant non-listed heritage asset
- Contrary to Neighbourhood Plan Policy EH-H9
- Modernist design would be highly visible from Lynx Hill
- Revised design is only modest and does not overcome objection
- modern design of rear elevation not appropriate to this Chown designed dwelling

Third party comments:

29 letters of representation have been received from 18 individuals raising the following objections and concerns to the originally submitted plans:

- distinctive Chown features will be destroyed
- Not in keeping with Chown style
- No mention of drainage and environmental measures (solar power, heat pump, rainwater harvesting) within Design and Access Statement
- Discrepancies in plans regarding proposed materials
- potential loss of hedges would make dwelling highly visible
- No details of proposed materials provided
- Rendered images in Design and Access Statement do not match proposed plans
- single storey rear extension out of character
- proposal overbearing on public bridleway, neighbouring properties and The Spinney Woodland
- light pollution from proposed roof lights
- dual aspect makes the application site visually sensitive

- overdevelopment of site
- cramped form of development
- Details of construction vehicle access should be provided
- imposing due to proximity to road

The following objections and concerns have been raised to the amended plans:

- proposal is out of proportion to the site
- retention of original porch is positive contribution but does not overcome objections
- poor design of single storey rear extension
- structural engineering concerns
- discrepancies in elevations and floor plans
- concern regarding materials
- impact from construction traffic
- no on site parking provision shown in the application plans
- proposal results in the demolition of a Chown house
- Condition should be attached to any permission to require boundary screening
- large expanse of glass to rear is out of character with surrounding development
- loss of privacy
- contrived design
- Climate change questionnaire answers are general and uninformative

25 letters of support have been received from 25 individuals outlining the following positive comments:

- Style and design fits with the arts and crafts Horsley area
- will enhance the appearance of the road
- proposal retains original Chown features
- creates a family home
- nice to see a neglected house updated
- current property is an eyesore
- Proposal in keeping with Pine Walk and Lynx Hill
- No loss of light or loss of privacy

Planning policies.

<u>National Planning Policy Framework (NPPF) 2023:</u> Chapter 2: Achieving Sustainable Development Chapter 4: Decision Making Chapter 12: Achieving Well Designed Places

<u>Guildford Borough Local Plan: Strategy and Sites (LPSS), 2015-2034:</u> The Guildford Borough Local Plan: strategy and sites was adopted by Council on 25 April 2019.

Policy S1: Presumption in favour of sustainable development Policy D1: Place shaping Policy D2: Climate change, sustainable design, construction and energy Policy D3: Historic Environment Policy ID4: Green and blue infrastructure

Guildford Borough Council: Development Management Policies (LPDMP) March 2023:

Policy H4: Housing Extensions and Alterations including Annexes Policy P7: Biodiversity in New Developments Policy D4: Achieving High Quality Design and Respecting Local Distinctiveness Policy D5: Protection of Amenity and Provision of Amenity Space Policy D12: Light Impacts and Dark Skies Policy D23: Non-designated Heritage Assets Policy ID10: Parking Standards

East Horsley Neighbourhood Plan 2017 - 2033 Policy EH-S1: Spatial Development in East Horsley Policy EH-EN2: Trees & Hedgerows Policy EH-EN4: Biodiversity Policy EH-H9: Heritage Assets

Supplementary planning documents:

Residential Extensions and Alterations SPD (2018) Parking Standards in New Developments SPD (March 2023)

Planning Considerations:

The main planning considerations in this case are:

- the principle of development
- the impact on the scale and character of the existing dwelling and surrounding area
- the impact on neighbouring amenity
- Highways and parking considerations
- Impact on Trees / Hedges and Biodiversity
- Sustainability
- Other Matters

The Principle of Development

The subject site is located within an established residential area where household extensions and alterations are not uncommon. The principle of an extension to facilitate additional and improved living space is therefore considered to be acceptable, providing it provides high quality standards of internal accommodation, a design appropriate in the context of its surroundings and constitutes neighbourly development.

The Impact on Scale and Character of Existing Building and Surrounding Area

Cherry Tree Cottage is a modest dormer bungalow, designed and built by Frank Chown, an Arts and Craft architect and developer who was active in the 1920's & 30's and who was hugely influential in the development and character of East Horsley. The building is not identified as a statutory or locally listed building but is considered to be of some local historical interest.

The property has been extended from the original dwelling to both the northern and southern flanks of the building. The current dwelling is constructed from traditional materials and has a hipped roof form with "eyebrow" windows to the dormers and ground floor windows. The main access to the dwelling is from Pine Walk with a secondary access from Lynx Hill.

Policy D1 of the Local Plan: Strategy and Sites 2019 requires new developments to achieve high quality design that responds to distinctive local character. Policy D4 of the Local Plan: Development Management Policies requires new development proposals to incorporate high quality design that contributes to local distinctiveness by demonstrating a clear understanding of place and should

respond positively to: history of a place; significant views (to and from); surrounding context; built and natural features of interest; prevailing character; landscape and topography.

Policy D23 of the Local Plan: Development Management Policies states that development proposals are expected to preserve and enhance the significance of non-designated heritage assets by responding to and respecting the special architectural and historical interest of the heritage asset and its local importance. Development proposals should be designed and sited to conserve the non-designated asset, any features of interest and its setting

Policy EH-H9 of the East Horsley Neighbourhood Plan relates to Heritage Assets within East Horsley and states that proposals for the development of non-listed buildings of historic significance or of special character will be assessed taking into account the scale of any harm or loss, the significance of the building concerned and any public benefit arising from the proposed development.

The proposed development seeks permission for a two storey side extension, a single storey rear extension, single storey front porch together with a roof extension to the existing dwelling to provide a first floor to the property. The northern flank of the proposal would have a cat slide roof, whilst the southern flank would have a gabled projections to both the front and rear elevations. The proposed single storey rear extension would have large glazed sliding doors to the rear and southern facing flank elevation and would have a false pitched to flat roof. The existing porch would be demolished and relocated to the south of the existing within a central location on the proposed front elevation. The proposal includes "eyebrow" windows to the front and rear elevation.

The Residential Extensions and Alterations SPD 2018 states that extensions and alterations should normally be consistent with the form, scale and style of the existing building by respecting proportions, reflecting existing character, using appropriate roof forms and complementing materials and detailing and matching the style, proportions and positioning of windows.

As the dwelling is considered to be of some local historical interest, the Council's Conservation and Design Officer was consulted on the application. Concerns were initially raised to the proposal, however, following the submission of amended plans the Conservation Officer is fully supportive of the amended application. The

design advice given by the Council has largely been followed. The retention of the decorative base plinth and bay windows, as well as the rebuilding of the original porch, all of which are authentic to the original structure, helps to preserve the legibility of the original Chown language. The removal of the twin hipped roof projection to the rear has help to simplify the general form of the proposal for the better and where elements of new language has been introduced, such as the geometric flat roofed kitchen/dining structure, these appear more considered, refined and complementary to property's character and design.

The proposed extensions, whilst changing the single storey character of the dwelling, are considered to reflect the original Chown character and detail of the building and therefore, are not considered to result in harm to the character of the dwelling, street scene and surrounding area. Concern has been raised in third party representations regarding the proposed materials. If planning permission is to be granted it is recommended the imposition of a condition to require samples and detailed specifications of all external materials to be used on the development to be submitted for consideration by the Local Planning Authority. This condition is considered necessary and appropriate to ensure that the proposed materials reflect the Chown style and are appropriate on this site and within this location.

Third party representations raise concern that the proposal would result in a cramped form of development and overdevelopment of the site. Whilst it is acknowledged that the proposal will increase the footprint of the building, the proposal would retain space and garden around the building and the proposal is not considered to represent an overdevelopment of the site.

The proposed works are therefore considered acceptable and would accord with Policy D1 of the Local Plan SS, Policies H4, D4 and D23 of the Local Plan DMP, the Residential Extensions and Alterations SPD (2018), Policy EH-H9 of the East Horsley Neighbourhood Plan and chapter 12 of the NPPF 2023.

The Impact on Neighbouring Amenity

The application site is bounded to the north west by Lynx Hill and to the east/south east by Pine Walk. To the south, the application site shares a boundary with Copseham Rise. The dwelling at Copseham Rise lies approximately 60 metres from the dwelling Cherry Tree Cottage.

Of the surrounding residential dwellings, Firtrees, Lynx Hill is sited closest to Cherry Tree Cottage with approximately 25 metres between built forms.

Due to the separation between dwellings and the orientation of the dwelling, the proposal would not result in loss of light, overbearing impact or loss of privacy for adjoining occupiers. The proposal is considered to comply with the requirements of Policy D5 of the Local Plan DMP.

Highways / Parking Considerations

The application site is located within the village area of East Horsley. The existing dwelling benefits from a single garage with driveway to the rear of the property, accessed from Lynx Hill, as well as parking to the front of the property, accessed from Pine Walk.

The proposal seeks to increase the dwelling to provide 5 bedrooms. The Parking Standards for New Development SPD 2023 requires development located in a village setting to provide 2.5 parking spaces for a 4+ bed dwelling. There is sufficient space around the dwelling to provide the required number of parking spaces. Therefore, the proposal would comply with the requirements of the Parking Standards SPD and Policy ID10 of the Local Plan Development Management Policies.

Concern has been raised regarding the potential impact on highway safety within Pine Walk and Lynx Hill. As the proposal is for extension to a single dwelling, it is considered that any impact from construction traffic will be temporary and will not result in permanent harm to the safety of the local highway network.

Due to the scale of the proposal, it was not considered necessary to consult the Local Highways Authority on the planning application.

Impact on Trees/hedges and Biodiversity

Concern is raised that any potential loss of the existing hedgerow will result in the development being highly visible within the street scene. Policy EH-EN2 of the East Horsley Neighbourhood Plan details that development proposals will be supported which comply with other policies in the development and ensure the retention of established hedgerows. Policy EH-EN4 of the East Horsley Neighbourhood Plan

details that developments should seek to enhance biodiversity, including through maintaining existing hedgerows. The existing hedge that provides screening to Lynx Hill and Pine Walk does not benefit from protection and as such could be maintained or felled without the prior approval of the Local Planning Authority.

The application form details that no trees or hedges will be removed as part of the proposal and the agent has confirmed that there is no intention to fell the hedge, therefore it was not considered necessary to consult the Council's Tree Officer.

As such, it is considered that the proposal would comply with the requirements of Policy EH-H2 and EH-EN4 of the East Horsley Neighbourhood Plan.

<u>Sustainability</u>

Local Plan DMP Policy D15 relates to Climate Change adaptation and states that development proposals are required to demonstrate how new buildings will be designed and constructed to provide for the comfort, health, and wellbeing of current and future occupiers over the lifetime of the development, covering the full range of expected climate impacts and with particular regard to overheating; and incorporate passive heat control measures, and the exclusion of conventional air conditioning, in line with the cooling hierarchy. The agent has provided a completed Climate Change, Energy and Sustainable Development Questionnaire.

Concern has been raised that the level of glazing proposed to the single storey rear extension will result in uncomfortable living conditions for the occupiers. The rear elevation of the property is west facing. The Climate Change Questionnaire details that the proposed thermal insulation will ensure that minimal cooling will be required and the design incorporates overhand soffits to provide solar shading. It is considered that due to the orientation of the dwelling on the application site and the measures proposed as part of the design, that the proposal would comply with the requirements of Policy D15 of the Local Plan Development Management Policies.

Other Matters

Other matters raised within third party representations include:

• No reference to drainage within Design and Access Statement

- Discrepancies in plans regarding proposed materials
- Light pollution from proposed roof lights
- structural engineering concerns

As the proposal is for an extension to an existing dwelling, it is expected that drainage will be as per that of the existing dwelling.

Discrepancies within plans has been noted and amended plans have been submitted to rectify these concerns.

The proposed roof lights have been removed from the amended plans and therefore any potential concerns regarding light pollution from the proposed skylights have been addressed.

The current planning application is for extensions to the dwelling not for demolition of the existing dwelling and rebuild. Structural concerns and whether the existing building is capable of being extended are not planning matters but will be addressed by current Building Control Regulations.

Conclusion

The site is located within the identified settlement area of East Horsley where the principle of development is considered acceptable. The proposed extensions have been assessed by the Council's Conservation and Design Officer, who has considered the impact of the development on the existing building and found no adverse impact on the character of the dwelling, street scene or surrounding area.

The proposed extensions are not considered to result in harm to the amenities of adjoining properties nor result in harm to highway safety.

Subject to conditions, it is recommended that planning permission be granted.